

# MINUTES OF THE SYDNEY EAST JOINT REGIONAL PLANNING PANEL MEETING HELD AT THE PLANNING ASSESSMENT COMMISSION, LEVEL 13, THAKRAL HOUSE, 301 GEORGE STREET, SYDNEY, ON WEDNESDAY 18 AUGUST 2010 AT 4.30 PM

## PRESENT:

John Roseth	Chair
David Furlong	Member
Mary-Lynne Taylor	Member
Ted Cassidy	Member
Lyall Kennedy	Member

## IN ATTENDANCE

Phil Sarin	Ashfield Council
------------	------------------

## APOLOGY: NIL

The meeting commenced at 4.30 pm.

### 1. Declarations of Interest – see Chair's Note later.

### 2. Business Items

**ITEM 1 - 2010SYE047 Ashfield DA No. 10.2009/234 – Two storey dwelling house, front fence and rear garage, 15 Park Avenue Ashfield**

**ITEM 2 - 2010SYE049 Ashfield DA No. 10.2009.155.1 – Two storey dwelling house, front fence and rear garage, 135 Park Avenue Ashfield**

**ITEM 3 - 2010SYE048 Ashfield DA No. 10.2009/235 – Demolition of a mixed residential/commercial building, 89-93B Liverpool Road Ashfield**

### 3. Public Submission -

#### **ITEM 1 - 15 Park Avenue Ashfield**

Michael Young	addressed the Panel against the item
David Cook (applicant)	addressed the Panel on behalf of the applicant
John Ward (applicant)	addressed the Panel on behalf of the applicant
Aurora Moroney (applicant)	addressed the Panel on behalf of the applicant

#### **Item 2 - 135 Park Avenue Ashfield**

David Cook (applicant)	addressed the Panel on behalf of the applicant
John Ward (applicant)	addressed the Panel on behalf of the applicant
Aurora Moroney (applicant)	addressed the Panel on behalf of the applicant

#### **Item 3 - 89-93B Liverpool Road Ashfield**

Aurora Moroney (applicant)	addressed the Panel on behalf of the applicant
----------------------------	--

#### 4. Business Item Recommendation

***ITEM 1 - 2010SYE047 Ashfield DA No. 10.2009/234 – Two storey dwelling house, front fence and rear garage, 15 Park Avenue Ashfield***

1. The Panel, by a majority of 3 to 2 (John Roseth, Mary-Lynne Taylor and David Furlong against Ted Cassidy and Lyall Kennedy) resolved to approve the application subject to the conditions recommended in Schedule 1 of the Panel Secretariat report and for the reasons listed in the planning assessment report.
2. David Furlong, while voting for approval, would prefer to defer the application to allow a redesign to overcome the concerns of the owner of No 13.
3. Lyall Kennedy, while voting for refusal, would prefer to defer the application to allow a redesign to overcome the concerns of the owner of No 13.
4. Ted Cassidy voted for refusal because the design is out context with the historical character and building form of Park Avenue and Park Lane.

***ITEM 2 - 2010SYE049 Ashfield DA No. 10.2009.155.1 – Two storey dwelling house, front fence and rear garage, 135 Park Avenue Ashfield***

1. The Panel, by a majority of 3 to 2 (John Roseth, Mary-Lynne Taylor and David Furlong against Ted Cassidy and Lyall Kennedy) resolved to approve the application subject to the conditions recommended in Schedule 1 of the Panel Secretariat report and for the reasons listed in the planning assessment report.
2. Lyall Kennedy voted for refusal because the building is out of character with the immediate streetscape which is single storey.
3. Ted Cassidy voted for refusal because of the excessive bulk and scale of the design which is out of character with the historic single storey dwellings of Park Avenue, because of the loss of privacy and overshadowing of adjoining dwellings and because the application is not in the public interest.

***ITEM 3 - 2010SYE048 Ashfield DA No. 10.2009/235 – Demolition of a mixed residential/commercial building, 89-93B Liverpool Road Ashfield***

1. The Panel, by a majority of 3 to 2 (John Roseth, Mary-Lynne Taylor and David Furlong against Ted Cassidy and Lyall Kennedy) resolved to approve the application subject to the conditions recommended in Schedule 1 of the Panel Secretariat report and for the reasons listed in the planning assessment report.
2. Lyall Kennedy voted for refusal because the application does not propose an active public use for the site following demolition.
3. Ted Cassidy voted for refusal because the building has an historical presentation to this section of Liverpool Road and the facade could be adaptively reused for any redevelopment proposed.

*Chair's Note (for all 3 applications) – The Chair notes that Ted Cassidy and Lyall Kennedy have recently voted against these applications at a Council meeting. The Chair believes that an independent observer would not consider that they approached the task of making a determination as members of the Panel with an open mind. The Chair believes therefore that their participation on the Panel is inappropriate. However, since the practical result of*

*their participation and their withdrawal from the Panel is the same, the Chair did not pursue the matter further.*

**MOTION CARRIED**

The meeting concluded at 6.25 pm.

Endorsed by

John Roseth  
Chair, Sydney East Region Planning Panel  
Date 31<sup>st</sup> August 2010